

Cases of "Review for Pal" on Geological Journal

Previously, we and our allies exposed some researchers in Geography gained massive publications through their editor friends, or even through their self-editing [1-2], raising concerns about the conflict of interest in those articles. Up to recently, over 1,000 articles were found with such conflict of interest [3], and much more are undetected due to that the information about the handling editors was not disclosed with the published articles.

However, finding a friend to handle their manuscripts was the first step to allow their articles published much easier, with less rigorous peer review. Our recent investigation suggests that some of those articles were reviewed by authors' friends (Review for Pal), too.

10.1002/gj.3871

10.1002/gj.3871

Geological Journal

SPECIAL ISSUE ARTICLE

Relict hydrocarbon seeps in the Oligocene–Miocene Subis carbonate platform, Malaysia: Implications on hydrocarbon generation and migration pathways and potential sealing by shale gouging

[Correction\(s\) for this article](#)

Muthuairavasamy Ramkumar, Ramasamy Nagarajan, Manoj J. Mathew, Benjamin Sautter, Numair A. Siddiqui, Bing B. Saw, M. Santosh, David Menier, Michael C. Poppelreiter

First published: 02 June 2020 | <https://doi.org/10.1002/gj.3871> | Citations: 5

Handling Editor: I. Somerville

Peer Review: The peer review history for this article is available at <https://publons.com/publon/10.1002/gj.3871>.

Reviewer Report	2020/03/01
Content	All the review are corrected and can be accepted for publishing
Reviewed by	Effi Helmy Ariffin
Reviewer Report	2020/01/17
Content	Thank you for incorporating the changes.
Reviewed by	Priyadarsi D. Roy

Geoscience Frontiers

Volume 11, Issue 4, July 2020, Pages 1215-1231

Research Paper

Plate tectonic control on the formation and tectonic migration of Cenozoic basins in northern margin of the South China Sea

Pengcheng Wang^{1,2,3}, Sanzhong Li^{1,2,3}, Yanhui Sun^{1,2,3}, Lingli Guo^{1,2,3}, Guangzeng Wang^{1,2,3}, Gege Hui^{1,2,3}, **Jan D. Somerville**^{1,2,3}, Xianzhi Cao^{1,2,3}, Yang Li^{1,2,3}

Show more

+ Add to Mendeley Share Cite

Science of The Total Environment

Volume 706, 1 March 2020, 121963

Total vulnerability of the littoral zone to climate change-driven natural hazards in north Brittany, France

Manoj Joseph Mathew¹, Benjamin Sautter¹, **Effi Helmy Ariffin**^{1,2,3}, David Menier¹, Mu Romkumar¹, **Numar Akmed Siddiqui**¹, **Hugo Delaune**¹, Nereo Del Estal¹, Kallil Tronck¹, Erwan Genesac¹

Show more

Chapter 13

Cenozoic Chemostratigraphy

Understanding the Most Recent Era of the Earth's History

Priyadarsi Geology Roy, **Muthuairavasamy Ramkumar**, Ramasamy Nagarajan

Book Editors: Alcides N. Sial, Claudis Gaucher, Muthuairavasamy Ramkumar, Valdeez Pinto Ferreira

First published: 19 November 2018 | <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781119382508.ch13> | Citations: 1

Book Series: Geophysical Monograph Series

PDF TOOLS SHARE

This article was published by M Ramkumar et. al. in 2020, and was handled by I Somerville, who had coauthorship with another author of this article, M Santosh, earlier than the publication of this article. The two reviewers also had connections to the authors. Before the publication of this article, P D Roy coauthored with M Ramkumar, while E H Ariffin coauthored with N A Siddiqui. During our investigation, an independent sleuth posted the linkage between E H Ariffin and N A Siddiqui on PubPeer [4], confirming the our outcome.

10.1002/gj.3800

This article was published by J Q Zhang et. al. in 2020, and was handled by L Tang. We notice both L Tang and M Santosh, one of the authors of this article, worked for a same institution, China University of Geosciences Beijing, and they had multiple coauthorship before the publication of this article, dated back to 2019. L Tang chose F Yang as a reviewer to this article. F Yang also had long history of coauthorship with M Santosh, which can date back to 2018. The name of the other reviewer was not disclosed.

10.1002/gj.3800

Geological Journal

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Tracing the genesis of skarn-type iron deposit in central North China Craton: Insights from mineral zoning textures in ore-forming intrusion

Correction(s) for this article

Ju-Quan Zhang , Li-Na Yan, M. Santosh, Sheng-Rong Li, Jing Lu, Dui-Xing Wang, Xian Liang, Lin-Xuan Wang, Ya-Qi Li

First published: 10 March 2020 | <https://doi.org/10.1002/gj.3800> | Citations: 6

 **Ore Geology Reviews**
Volume 111, August 2019, 102998

Multistage processes linked to tectonic transition in the genesis of orogenic gold deposit: A case study from the Shangong lode deposit, East Qinling, China

Li Tang , Xin-Kai Hu , M. Santosh , Shou-Ting Zhang , Christopher J. Spencer , Heejin Jeon , Yu Zhao , Hua-Wen Cao 

Show more

5GH Foundation

There are some minor questions:

- (1) Where did the mixing and homogenization happen? In the boundary of lower crust and mantle? Or in the magma chamber at middle crust? Your evidence just illustrates the chemo-physical conditions at ~17 km deep.
- (2) Where are the pyroxene minerals which were sourced from the injections of basaltic magmas?
- (3) There are some comments in the annotated PDF. Please check them and revise.

Related small mistakes have been made into the noted PDF file. Please see it. Hoping these comments will improve the current manuscript.

Reviewed by

Fan Yang



Gondwana Research
Volume 60, August 2018, Pages 153-178

Mesozoic magmatism in the eastern North China Craton: Insights on tectonic cycles associated with progressive craton destruction

Fan Yang , M. Santosh , Sung Won Kim 

Show more

10.1002/gj.3959

This article was published by C Manikyamba et. al. in 2020, and it was handled by L Tang with China University of Geosciences Beijing. For one hand, the handling editor L Tang had publication records with two of the authors, C Manikyamba and S Ganguly, earlier than the publication of this article. For the other hand, the two reviewers L Tang chose, E Shaji and K R Hari, also had publications with S Ganguly, one of the authors of this article, before or during the period of the publication of this article.

10.1002/gj.3959

Geological Journal

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Gold, uranium, thorium, and rare earth mineralization in the Kadiri Volcanic Province of Eastern Dharwar Craton, India: An evaluation of mineralogical, textural, and geochemical attributes

Correction(s) for this article

Chakravadhanula Manikyamba, Naresh C Ghose, Sohini Ganguly, Arjit Pahari, Challa Satyasri Sindhuja

First published: 23 August 2020 | <https://doi.org/10.1002/gj.3959> | Citations: 5

Peer Review: The peer review history for this article is available at <https://publons.com/publon/10.1002/gj.3959>.

Handling Editor: L. Tang

Funding information: Council of Scientific and Industrial Research, Grant/Award Number: MLP 6406-28 (CM); Department of Science and Technology, India, Grant/Award Number: ST/SR/54/ES-510/2010; DST Inspire Faculty Project, Grant/Award Number: IFA14-EAS-25

Reviewer Report 2020/06/09

Content: The authors carried out textural and mineralogical studies of a suite of volcanic rocks from the Kadiri Volcanic Province of southern peninsular India and assessed the economic mineral potential of that area. They argued that the emplacements of rhyolite and alkali granite appears to be synchronous with the major thermal event at 2.51 Ga of the Dharwar craton. The diverse volcanic associations are formed in a subduction-accretion orogeny at ~2.7 Ga, coeval with the global accretion event and gold mineralization. Au-U-Th-REE abundances in the composite arc-back arc system of Kolar-Hutti-Kadiri-Jonnagiri greenstone belts of EDC are primarily attributed to devolatilization and melting of subducted oceanic slab, fluid-fluxed metasomatism of mantle wedge and elemental cycling associated with different stages of subduction. After going through the manuscript, I found that this contribution to be important pieces of work. The manuscript is well written with nicely prepared figures and tables. I do not have any hesitation to recommend this work to be published in Geological Journal.

Reviewed by: K R HARI

Reviewer Report 2020/07/05

Content: Dear Authors, I have critically reviewed the MS. My comments are given in the annotated file. The paper can be trimmed, without compromising merit of the paper, by avoiding irrelevant portions. Give more focus on this study and try to bring more science into it.

Reviewed by: E Shaji

Geoscience Frontiers

Volume 10, Issue 8, November 2019, Pages 2239-2249

Research Paper

Phanerozoic magmatism in the Proterozoic Cuddapah Basin and its connection with the Pangean supercontinent

Th. Dhanalakshmi Singh, C. Manikyamba, S. E. Li Tang, Sohini Ganguly, M. Santosh, K.S.V. Subramaniam, Anshu C. Khivra

* CSIR-National Geophysical Research Institute (Council of Scientific and Industrial Research), Uppal Road, Hyderabad 500009, India

† School of Earth Sciences and Resources, China University of Geosciences Beijing, 29 Xuyuan Road, Beijing 100083, China

‡ Department of Earth Sciences, Goa University, Talegoa Plateau, Goa 403204, India

§ Centre for Technics, Exploration and Research, University of Adelaide, Adelaide, SA 5005, Australia

¶ Key Lab of Submarine Geosciences and Prospecting Techniques, MOE AND College of Marine Geosciences, Ocean University of China, Qingdao 266100, China

Geoscience Frontiers

Volume 10, Issue 1, January 2019, Pages 241-264

Research Paper

Extensional collapse of the Gondwana orogen: Evidence from Cambrian mafic magmatism in the Trivandrum Block, southern India

Qiang-Yan Yang, Sohini Ganguly, E. Shaji, X. Bi, Yunpeng Dong, V. Nanda-Kumar

Add to Mendeley Share Cite

<https://doi.org/10.1002/gf.20172.862>

Evolution of the Indian subcontinent: Introduction (PDF from uniga.ac.in)

Author: [Redacted] Editor: [Redacted] Critiques: 14 Reviews

Publication: 2019

Publication: Wiley

Description: Peninsular India is a composite collage of cratonic blocks and orogenic belts, which preserves the records of almost the entire history of our shared tectonic basin (1.2 Ga to 10 Ma). The timing of growth of the collisional orogen and related tectonics in the Indian Shield and the associated Andean-style magmatism and orogenic metallogenesis are also important in understanding the tectonic changes in tectonic plates and crust. The orogenic belts in India are characterized by various tectonic styles, as well as the subduction and subvolcanism. This rapid orogenic cycle of the Indian Shield during the final supercontinent of the Gondwana and in Pangea, presents the nearly one-order-of-magnitude extension that led the Deccan Plateau, and the subsequent growth of the great Indian Ocean basin, are the direct result of the collisional orogeny. The tectonic evolution of the Indian Shield is closely related to the evolution of the supercontinent of the Indian subcontinent from its history in the Early Earth to the present. This book aims to reconstruct the tectonic evolution of the Indian Shield from the birth of the supercontinent of the Gondwana to the present.

Total citations: Cited by 2

10.1002/gj.3918

This article was published by S P Verma et. al. in 2020, and was handled by J S Armstrong-Altrin. Armstrong-Altrin and Verma had a very long history of coauthorship before the publication of this article, and Armstrong-Altrin chose F Velasco-Tapia, another friend of Verma, to review this article. The name of the other reviewer was not disclosed.

10.1002/gj.3918

Geological Journal

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Geochemistry, petrogenesis, and tectonic setting of the Los Tuxtlas Volcanic Field, Mexico

Correction(s) for this article

Surendra P. Verma  Héctor López-Loera, Konduri S. V. Subramanyam, Chakravadhanula ManikyambaFirst published: 03 August 2020 | <https://doi.org/10.1002/gj.3918> | Citations: 7

Handling Editor: J.S. Armstrong-Altrin

Peer Review: The peer review history for this article is available at <https://publons.com/publon/10.1002/gj.3918>.[Home](#) > [Turkish Journal of Earth Sciences](#) > Vol. 29 (2020) > No. 3[Turkish Journal of Earth Sciences](#)

APMdisc: An online computer program for the geochemical discrimination of siliciclastic sediments from active and passive margins

MARÍA ABDELALY RIVERA-GÓMEZ

JOHN SELVAMONY ARMSTRONG-ALTRIN

SURENDRA P. VERMA

LORENA DÍAZ-GONZÁLEZ

5GH Foundation

PEER REVIEW HISTORY: ZIBERNA, L., KLEMMER, S., NIMIS, P. 2013. Garnet and spinel in fertile and depleted mantle: insights from thermodynamic modeling. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology 166, 411-421.

Ziberna, L., Klemme, S., Nimis, P. 2013. Garnet and spinel in fertile and depleted mantle: insights from thermodynamic modeling. Contributions to Mineralogy and Petrology 166, 411-421.

Reviewed by

Fernando Velasco-Tapia

CITE THIS REVIEW
DOI10.1002/GJ.3918/V1/REVIEW1 

Journal of South American Earth Sciences

Volume 95, November 2019, 102311



Petrogenetic and tectonic implications of Oligocene–Miocene volcanic rocks from the Sierra de San Miguelito complex, central Mexico

Darío Torres-Sánchez , Sanjeet K. Verma , Surendra P. Verma Fernando Velasco-Tapia , José Ramón Torres-Hernández 

10.1002/gj.3878

This article was published by M Z Iqbal et. al. in 2020, and was handled by S Li. One of the reviewers, S Y Yu, had strong linkage to one of the authors, Y J Liu. Both Yu and Liu worked for a same institution, Ocean University of China, and they had long history of coauthorship before and during the period of the publication of this article. The name of the other reviewer was not disclosed.

10.1002/gj.3878

5GH Foundation

Geological Journal

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Clockwise hairpin-type metamorphic pressure–temperature (P–T) path recorded in the Shangla blueschist along the Indus Suture Zone, Pakistan Himalaya[Correction\(s\) for this article](#)Muhammad Zahoor Iqbal, Weimin Li, Asghar Ali, [Yongjiang Liu](#), Duo ZhangFirst published: 10 June 2020 | <https://doi.org/10.1002/gj.3878> | Citations: 3

Handling Editor: S. Li

Peer Review: The peer review history for this article is available at

<https://publons.com/publon/10.1002/gj.3878>.

Funding information: National Natural Science Foundation of China, Grant/Award Number: Grant no. 91755212

Reviewed by

are strong foliated, and some of them are radiated, probably are related to the different rock occurrences. Maybe the radiated ones are selected from the center of the hard block, which is difficult to be deformed, however, the margin ones may easy to be deformed. How do you think it? you may give a brief discussion on the petrography.

8. It is better to provide a table which shows the mineral assemblage for three groups of blueschists, in order to better understanding the difference between them.

9. For the reference list, you have to follow the format of Geological Journal, recently some of them are not correct. Check them carefully.

10. Figure 1. all the abbreviations of the belts are interpreted in the figure captions. Make sure that all the mentioned areas in the text are shown in the figure.

11. Figure 3. there is no scale for the Fig A, and the scale for center figure in A is unable to see.

Shengyao Yu

Home > Swiss Journal of Geosciences > Article

Widespread Permian granite magmatism in Lower Austroalpine units: significance for Permian rifting in the Eastern Alps

Original paper | [Open access](#) | Published: 11 November 2020
Volume 113, article number 16, (2020) | [Cite this article](#)

[Download PDF](#) | You have full access to this open access article

Sihua Yuan, Franz Neubauer, [Yongjiang Liu](#), Johann Genser, Boran Liu, [Shengyao Yu](#), [Jiahong Chang](#) & Qingbin Guan

3469 Accesses | [Explore all metrics](#)

Journal of Asian Earth Sciences

Volume 190, 1 April 2020, 104164

Cretaceous granitic intrusions in Fujian Province, Cathaysia Block: Implications for slab rollback and break-off of the Paleo-Pacific plate

Zhengyu Wang*, Xilin Zhao, [Shengyao Yu](#) ^{1,2}, Sanzhong Li ^{1,3}, Yinbao Peng ⁴, [Yongjiang Liu](#) ⁵

Show more

[Add to Mendeley](#) [Share](#) [Cite](#)

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jseaes.2020.104164> | [Get rights and content](#)

Home > Swiss Journal of Geosciences > Article

The Wechsel Gneiss Complex of Eastern Alps: an Ediacaran to Cambrian continental arc and its Early Proterozoic hinterland

Original paper | [Open access](#) | Published: 29 November 2020
Volume 113, article number 21, (2020) | [Cite this article](#)

[Download PDF](#) | You have full access to this open access article

Franz Neubauer, [Yongjiang Liu](#), [Jiahong Chang](#), Sihua Yuan, [Shengyao Yu](#), Johann Genser, Boran Liu & Qingbin Guan

3818 Accesses | [Explore all metrics](#)

10.1002/gj.3864

This article was published by J Madhavaraju et. al. in 2020, and was handled by R Nagarajan. One of the reviewers, Paul-Desire Ndjigui, had coauthorship with one of the authors, J S Armstrong-Altrin. They co-authored in an article published in the same time of the publication of this article. Regarding to the other two reviewers, one of them was anonymous, and the other has no linkage to the authors of this article.

10.1002/gj.3864

Geological Journal

SPECIAL ISSUE ARTICLE

Geochemistry of sands from the Huatabampo and Altata beaches, Gulf of California, Mexico

Correction(s) for this article

Jayagopal Madhavaraju, John S. Armstrong-Altrin, Rahul B. Pillai, Teresa Pi-Puig

First published: 04 June 2020 | <https://doi.org/10.1002/gj.3864> | Citations: 36

Handling Editor: R. Nagarajan

Peer Review: The peer review history for this article is available at <https://publons.com/publon/10.1002/gj.3864>.

Funding information: DGAPA, Universidad Nacional Autonoma de Mexico, Mexico, Grant/Award Number: PAPIIT-IN111018

Reviewer Report

2020/01/30 ^

Content

Please, see the manuscript.

Reviewed by

Paul-Desire Ndjigui

[Home](#) > [Arabian Journal of Geosciences](#) > [Article](#)**Characterization and potential application of gleysols and ferralsols for ceramic industry: a case study from Dimako (Eastern Cameroon)**

Original Paper | Published: 20 November 2020

Volume 13, article number 1074, (2020) [Cite this article](#)

Josti M. Doum, Gentry C. Fuh, Soureiyatou Fadil-Djenabou, Vincent Laurent Onana, Paul-Desire Ndjigui, John S. Armstrong-Altrin

Cite this articleDoum, J.M., Fuh, G.C., Fadil-Djenabou, S. et al. Characterization and potential application of gleysols and ferralsols for ceramic industry: a case study from Dimako (Eastern Cameroon). *Arab J Geosci* 13, 1074 (2020). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12517-020-06007-0>[Download citation](#)Received
05 January 2020Accepted
11 September 2020Published
20 November 2020

DOI

<https://doi.org/10.1007/s12517-020-06007-0>

These six articles were listed on an Correction published by "Geological Journal", a Wiley title, early this month (May 8th, 2025). The Correction addresses the concerns in 98 articles coauthored by at least one of the associate editors of the journal, which may cause conflict of interest in the publications. Although the Correction states that "the [editorial and peer review] process was found to be sound, and the publisher considers the results presented in all affected articles to be reliable", but it was not. Our investigation reveals that some of the peer review process for those articles were affected with "Review for Pal", namely, the articles were reviewed by the friends of the authors. The peer review process should had been supervised by the handling editors and/or the editor in chief of the journal, however, this process was affected partly because of "Edit for Pal", namely, the articles were handled by the friends of the authors. The potential conflict of interest in those articles is not only the issues that associate editors coauthored in them, but also "Edit for Pal" and "Review for Pal", which were not addressed on the Correction by the journal.

It is very hard to estimate how many articles were affected with "Review for Pal". Only 13 of those 98 articles have open peer review records, but 46% (6 of 13) of them were found to be reviewed by the friends of the authors. Considering the small size of the sample, it is impossible to reach a conclusion here, but this matter should be seriously investigated by the journal or the publisher.

[1] 5GH-WuGH-20240603.001 (<http://www.5gh.org.cn/WuGH/2024/20240603.001.html>) (in Chinese)

[2] 5GH-WuGH-20240611.001 (<http://www.5gh.org.cn/WuGH/2024/20240611.001.html>)

[3] Editor-Author Conflict of Interest Examples Posted on PubPeer (pubpeer.com/search?q=editor+%2Bauthor+%2Blinked)

[4] PubPeer Comment on 10.1002/gj.3871

(<https://pubpeer.com/publications/0A969F4CF1BA3A17D9D716D29677BA>)

[5] 10.1002/gj.5230

This article is licensed to the 5GH Foundation under a CC BY-NC-ND 4.0 International License